Social Inquiry and Bayesian Inference: Rethinking Qualitative Research

Tasha Fairfield
London School of Economics

Andrew E. Charman
University of California, Berkeley

Forthcoming

Cambridge University Press

Contents

Acknowledgements **1**

I FOUNDATIONS **18**

1 Introduction: Bayesian Reasoning for Qualitative Research **19**

1.1 Placing Our Approach in Perspective 22

1.1.1 Process Tracing 23

1.1.2 Qualitative Methods 24

1.1.3 Multi-Method Research 25

1.2 A Guide for Readers 26

1.3 Scope of the Book 27

1.3.1 Foundations 28

1.3.2 Operationalizing Bayesian Reasoning in Qualitative Research 32

1.3.3 Bayesianism in Methodological Perspective 40

1.3.4 Bayesian Implications for Research Design 43

1.4 A Spotlight on Low-Tech Best Practices 46

2 Fundamentals of Bayesian Probability 48

2.1 Introduction 48

2.2 Deductive Logic 51

2.2.1 Boolean Algebra 52

2.2.2 Deductive Structure 55

2.3 Probability Theory 57

2.3.1 Disjunction Rule 59

2.3.2 Law of Total Probability (Marginalization) 61

2.3.3 Bayes' Rule (Conditionalization) 63

2.4 Applying the Laws of Probability 64

2.4.1 A Walk in the Park 66

2.4.2 Partisan Coupling 69

2.4.3 Game Show 71

2.4.4 A Rare Disease 75

Appendices

2.A Deduction, Induction, and Abduction 78

2.B Deriving the Product and Sum Rules from the Rationality Desiderata 81

2.B.1 Conjunction 81

2.B.2 Logical Negation 86

2.B.3 Emergence of the Product and Sum Rules 88

2.C Deriving the Principle of Indifference from the Rationality Desiderata 90

II OPERATIONALIZING BAYESIAN REASONING IN QUALITATIVE RESEARCH 94

3 Heuristic Bayesian Reasoning 95

3.1 Introduction 95

3.2 Bayes' Rule for Updating Degrees of Belief in Hypotheses 98

3.3 The Hypothesis Space 100

3.3.1 Hypotheses as Logical Propositions 100

3.3.2 Specifying Concrete Alternatives 103

3.3.3 Mutual Exclusivity and Exhaustiveness 105

3.4 Prior Odds 118

3.5 Evidence 123

3.6 Likelihood Ratios 126

3.6.1 Inhabit the World of Each Hypothesis 127

3.6.2 Testimonial Evidence: Assess the Likelihood that Source S Stated X . . . 131

3.6.3 Condition on Previously-Incorporated Evidence 133

3.7 Drawing an Inference from Multiple Pieces of Evidence 138

3.8 Conclusion 140

3.9 Exercises: Constructing Mutually Exclusive Hypotheses from Contributing Causes 141

3.10 Exercises: Envisioning Discriminating Evidence 143

Appendix

3.A Scenarios within Worlds: Partitioning Likelihoods 145

4 Explicit Bayesian Analysis **147**

4.1 Introduction 147

4.2 Bayes' Rule in Log-Odds Form 149

4.3 Quantifying Probabilities on a Logarithmic Scale 152

4.4 Consistency Checks 160

4.4.1 Parsing the Evidence Differently 161

4.4.2 Altering the Order of Evidence 163

4.4.3 Considering Other Pairs of Hypotheses 164

4.4.4 Additional Guidance 165

4.5 Application: Tax Reform in Chile 166

4.5.1 Research Question and Hypotheses 167

4.5.2 Weighing the Evidence 169

4.5.3 Aggregating Weights of Evidence 179

4.5.4 Assessing Whether a Joint Hypothesis is Merited 179

4.5.5 Key Conceptual Points to Remember . . . 181

4.6 How Much Evidence To Collect and When to Stop . . . 183

4.7 Conclusion . . . 188

4.8 Exercise: *"Silver Blaze"* Weights of Evidence . . . 191

5 Bayesian Analysis with Multiple Cases 195

5.1 Introduction . . . 195

5.2 Cross-Case Inference: Democratic Mobilization in Southeast Asia . . . 197

5.2.1 The Philippines . . . 199

5.2.2 Vietnam . . . 206

5.2.3 Aggregating Weights of Evidence Across Cases . . . 208

5.2.4 Overview of Cross-Case Analysis . . . 210

5.3 Cross-Case Inference: State Building in Latin America . . . 211

5.3.1 Peru and Chile . . . 213

5.3.2 Conceptual and Practical Lessons for Bayesian Inference . . . 225

5.4 Generalizing Scope Conditions . . . 228

5.4.1 State Building in Latin American and Beyond: Prussia . . . 232

5.4.2 Evaluating the Results and Deciding How to Move Forward . . . 237

5.5 Comparative Thinking in Bayesian Analysis . . . 242

5.6 Conclusion . . . 246

6 Hypotheses and Priors Revisited **249**

6.1 Introduction . . . 249

6.2 Hypothesis Space . . . 250

6.2.1 What MEE Means . . . 250

6.2.2 What MEE Does Not Mean . . . 252

6.2.3 Why We Need MEE Hypotheses . . . 254

6.2.4 Strategies for Constructing Mutually Exclusive Hypotheses . . . 258

6.2.5 Contributing Causes vs. Mutually Exclusive Hypotheses . . . 263

6.3 Occam Factors: A Conceptual Introduction . . . 264

6.4 Occam Penalties in Bayesian Model Comparison . . . 269

6.4.1 The Six of Spades Example . . . 270

6.4.2 The Chilean Tax Reform Case . . . 271

6.5 Joint Hypotheses and Priors: Democratic Mobilization Revisited . . . 281

6.5.1 Rival Hypotheses . . . 281

6.5.2 Weights of Evidence . . . 284

6.6 Conclusion . . . 290

6.7 Exercise: "Silver Blaze" Priors . . . 291

7 Scrutinizing Qualitative Research **293**

7.1 Introduction . . . 293

7.2 A Framework for Scrutiny . . . 295

7.2.1 Assessing Whether Inference Follows Bayesian Logic 295

7.2.2 Scrutinizing Weight of Evidence 297

7.2.3 Sensitivity Analysis 303

7.3 Scrutinizing Narrative-Form Analysis: The Fashoda Crisis 309

7.3.1 Hypotheses, Evidence, and Suggested Exercises 312

7.3.2 Weights of Evidence 315

7.3.3 Evaluation 323

7.4 Scrutinizing Narrative-Form Analysis: Land Reform in Egypt 326

7.4.1 The Power-Consolidation Hypothesis 327

7.4.2 Power-Consolidation vs. Humanitarianism 329

7.4.3 Power Consolidation vs. U.S. Pressure 339

7.4.4 Power Consolidation vs. Developmental Goals 343

7.4.5 Evaluation 349

7.5 Writing Bayesian Case Narratives 353

7.6 Conclusion 356

7.7 Exercises 357

III BAYESIANISM IN METHODOLOGICAL PERSPECTIVE 361

8 Comparing Logical Bayesianism to Frequentism 362

8.1 Introduction 362

8.2 Conceptualizations of Probability 364

8.3 Frequentist Inference 366

8.3.1 Null Hypothesis Significance Testing 366

8.3.2 Parameter Estimation 371

8.4 Critique of Frequentism 374

8.4.1 Probability as Relative Frequency 374

8.4.2 Alternative-Free Hypothesis Testing 377

8.4.3 Hypothetical Data 381

8.4.4 Pre-Data Questions and Long-Run Answers 389

8.4.5 Arbitrariness and Subjectivity 391

8.4.6 Meta-Analysis 396

8.5 Conclusion 398

8.6 Exercise: Opening a Can of Beans—What is Random? 401

Appendices

8.A Example: P-Values vs. Weights of Evidence 404

8.B Example: Frequentist vs. Bayesian Rocket Science 406

8.C Example: Frequentist Confidence Intervals vs. Bayesian Credible Intervals 409

9 A Unified Framework for Inference 412

9.1 Introduction 412

9.2 The Intellectual Terrain of Multi-Method Research 414

9.3 Synthesizing Quantitative vs. Qualitative and Cross-Case vs. Within-Case Analysis 417

9.4 Toward A Unified Approach to Qualitative Methods 427

9.4.1 Surveying the Terrain 428

9.4.2 Bayesianism and Process Tracing 434

9.4.3 Remapping the Qualitative Methods Landscape from a Bayesian Perspective 439

9.5 Bridging the Experimental vs. Observational Divide 442

9.5.1 Randomization is Not a Silver Bullet 444

9.5.2 Where "No Learning from Observational Research" Goes Wrong 449

9.5.3 Learning from Both Observational and Experimental Research: John Snow on Cholera 451

9.5.4 Control and Informativeness 463

9.6 A More Fundamental Dimension: Objective vs. Subjective Likelihoods 469

9.7 Conclusion 474

Appendices

9.A Distinctions between Logical Bayesianism and Earlier Bayesian Process Tracing Literature 480

9.B Irrelevance of Randomization to Post-Data Inference 487

9.C Objective Likelihoods from Categorical Data: A Party-Preference Survey 491

IV BAYESIAN IMPLICATIONS FOR RESEARCH DESIGN 494

10 Iterative Research 495

10.1 Introduction 495

10.2 Perspectives on Iterative Research 500

10.3 Bayesian Logic of Iterative Research 502

10.3.1 Old vs. New Evidence and Prior vs. Posterior Probabilities 503

10.3.2 "New" vs. "Independent" Evidence 507

10.3.3 Curtailing Confirmation Bias and ad hoc Theorizing 511

10.4 Iteration in Practice 515

10.4.1 Assigning Prior Log-Odds after Devising a New Hypothesis 518

10.4.2 Weights of Evidence for the New Hypothesis 518

10.4.3 Posterior Log-Odds 520

10.4.4 Conceptual and Practical Lessons 521

10.5 Common Concerns 522

10.5.1 Biased Priors 523

10.5.2 Biased Likelihoods 527

10.5.3 Intellectual Integrity 532

10.6 Conclusion 534

Appendix

10.A Extending the Hypothesis Space 536

11 Test Strength **541**

11.1 Introduction 541

11.2 Van Evera's Tests 543

11.2.1 Bayesian Intuition 544

11.2.2 Subsequent Interpretations 545

11.3 Sensitivity and Specificity: Advances and Limitations 547

11.3.1 From Certainty and Uniqueness to Sensitivity and Specificity 548

11.3.2 Shortcomings of Sensitivity and Specificity Coordinates 551

11.4 Improved Coordinates for Generalizing Van Evera's Tests 555

11.4.1 Likelihood Ratios or Weights of Evidence 555

11.4.2 Relative Entropies 567

11.4.3 Expected Information Gain and Asymmetry 569

11.5 Comparison of Test Coordinates and Numerical Examples 571

11.6 Social Science vs. Medical Diagnosis: Decisions, Utility, and Test Strength 576

11.7 Conclusion 579

Appendix

11.A Dinosaur Extinction 580

11.A.1 The Chicxulub Crater 580

11.A.2 Tanis Fossil Site 582

12 Case Selection **587**

12.1 Introduction 587

12.2 Touring the Terrain 589

12.3 Optimal Bayesian Case Selection 593

12.3.1 The Information-Theoretic Perspective 593

12.3.2 Relative Entropy 597

12.3.3 Expected Information Gain 601

12.3.4 Practical Caveats and Principled Insights 601

12.4 Heuristic Bayesian Case Selection 604

12.4.1 There is no need to begin by listing all known cases 604

12.4.2 Diversity among cases is generally good 606

12.4.3 Similarities across cases can also contribute to strong tests 608

12.4.4 There is no need to avoid cases with multiple plausible causes or confounders 609

12.4.5 Use model-conforming cases for mechanistic inferences and deviant cases for building or testing higher-level theory 611

12.4.6 At the end of the day, worry less about case selection and prioritize practical concerns as needed 615

12.4.7 Give a clear and honest rationale for focusing on particular cases and excluding others 616

12.5 A Requiem for Most-Likely and Least-Likely Cases 618

12.5.1 Scope Conditions 621

12.5.2 Prior Probabilities 622

12.5.3 Likelihood of Case Evidence 624

12.5.4 Marginal Likelihood of Case Evidence 625

12.5.5 Divergent Likelihoods 626

12.5.6 Van Evera Tests 628

12.5.7 Nested Regression Models 629

12.5.8 Rethinking the "Sinatra Inference" 630

12.5.9 Hard Tests vs. Strong Tests: Bayes, Popper, and Van Evera 633

12.5.10 Moving Forward: Retire the Most/Least-Likely Case 638

12.6 Conclusion 638

Appendices

12.A Prevalent Case-Selection Strategies 640

12.B Mutual Information 645

12.C Understanding Why Prior Probabilities Do Not Vary Across Cases 646

12.D Understanding Marginal Likelihoods in the Context of Case-Based Research . . . 649

12.D.1 Handling Case-Specific Evidence 651

12.D.2 Bayesian Probabilities vs. Relative Frequencies 652

12.E More on "Hard" Tests and "Bold" Theories 654

12.F Definitions of Most-Likely Cases and Least-Likely Cases 657

13 Worked Examples **664**

13.1 Constructing Mutually Exclusive Hypotheses (Chapter 3) 664

13.2 Envisioning Discriminating Evidence: The Empty Cookie Jar (Chapter 3) 666

13.3 "Silver Blaze" Exercises (Chapters 4 & 6) 668

13.3.1 Weights of Evidence 669

13.3.2 Prior Log-Odds 675

13.3.3 Posterior Log-Odds 678

13.4 Campaign Contributions and Austerity Reforms (Chapter 7) 679

13.5 Opening a Can of Beans: What is Random? (Chapter 8) 682

References and Further Reading **686**

Index **728**